“The Constitution is relatively short and open to a lot of interpretation. The U.S. Supreme Court has the power to decide in each criminal case if something is cruel or unusual. The definition can change over time.”
Gustavo Rivera
New York State Senator

“To me, cruel and unusual punishment is any government action that is meant to be harmful for the sake of being harmful. That action doesn’t connect to the treatment of an individual.”
Gustavo Rivera
New York State Senator

Is Justice For All?
Is Justice For All?

The Eighth Amendment to the United States Constitution says “cruel and unusual punishments [should not be] inflicted.” But what is cruel and unusual punishment? How does an amendment written in 1791 relate to issues today?

In the winter of 2017, CUP collaborated with Teaching Artist Meredith Degyansky and the International Community High School’s 11th grade to peel back the pages of the U.S. Constitution. To investigate, students got out of the classroom and into the politics of our justice system to speak with people about current issues related to cruel and unusual punishment.

Should minors be charged as adults? Should inmates be held in solitary confinement? Who decides?

Students created Public Service Announcements (PSAs) to teach others what they learned, and this postcard set so that you can let elected officials know what you think about issues related to the Eighth Amendment.

The Center for Urban Pedagogy (CUP) is a nonprofit organization that uses the power of design and art to increase meaningful civic engagement, particularly among historically underrepresented communities.

City Studies are CUP’s project-based, in-class and afterschool programs that use design and art as tools to research the city. To learn more about CUP, visit welcometoCUP.org

The International Community High School (ICHS) is a progressive public school for English language learners in the South Bronx. To learn more, visit ichs.weebly.com

This project was made possible by the Bay and Paul Foundations, the New York State Council on the Arts with the support of Governor Andrew M. Cuomo and the New York State Legislature, and the New York City Department of Cultural Affairs in partnership with the City Council. Additional support was provided by Council Member Melissa Mark-Viverito.

To view the PSAs created by the students, visit bit.ly/2ipgJfX
Recently, New York was just one of two states that treated 16 and 17 year olds as adults. The ‘Raise the Age’ reform states that there is a major difference between minors and adults, and that they should be treated differently. Adult prisons are not designed with kids in mind.”

Gustavo Rivera
New York State Senator

“In some extreme cases, we may need to treat a minor like an adult, but I believe that is a very, very small sliver of cases.”

Gustavo Rivera
New York State Senator

“There is scientific research that shows that the human brain is not fully formed until the age of 25. The juvenile justice system can still hold individuals accountable for their actions while recognizing that kids are really different in their decision making process than adults.”

Kate Rubin
Youth Represent

“If you commit the crime as a minor in the first-degree, something that was premeditated and violent like murder, then you should be tried as an adult. That minor took the time to plan the crime.”

Benny Vargas
NYPD Detective

“Children tried as adults face dramatically different treatment. They face longer sentences and fewer resources while incarcerated. They are at the highest risk of assault out of all inmate populations and they are more likely to commit more crimes when they are older.”

Kate Rubin
Youth Represent

To investigate all sides of the debate, students from the International Community High School in the Bronx interviewed people invested in New York City’s justice system, from community members to government officials.

To learn more about legal services for minors, visit youthrepresent.org
What do you think?

"External factors, like public opinion, can influence Supreme Court decisions."

Gustavo Rivera
New York State Senator

To learn more about this project, visit: welcometoCUP.org/Projects/CityStudies/IsJusticeForAll

To contact the Supreme Court, visit: supremecourt.gov/contact/contactus.aspx
Should inmates be held in solitary confinement?

To investigate all sides of the debate, students from the International Community High School in the Bronx interviewed people invested in New York City’s justice system, from community members to government officials.

“For a short time, it can allow someone to cool down and reflect. It’s like a time out for a person to regain control of themselves.”
Benny Vargas
NYPD Detective

“Solitary confinement is ultimately a form of torture. It is cruel and unusual punishment.”
Gustavo Rivera
New York State Senator

“How is the justice system supposed to make you a better member of society if you’re locked up in basically a closet? No one is going to learn anything in isolation.”
Benny Vargas
NYPD Detective

“Sometimes it can be rehabilitative, such as the proposed Humane Alternative to Long-Term (HALT) Solitary Confinement Act in the New York State Legislature. It doesn’t have to mean depriving an individual of resources and violating their basic human rights.”
Victor Pate
NY Statewide Organizer

“Solitary confinement is ultimately a form of torture. It is cruel and unusual punishment.”
Gustavo Rivera
New York State Senator

“There’s absolutely no evidence that solitary confinement makes people less likely to commit a crime. Statistics actually show that they are more likely to reoffend. It causes real trauma, psychological damage, and increases the chances of self-harm when somebody is isolated from all human contact.”
Kate Rubin
Youth Represent

To learn more about HALT, visit nycaic.org
What do you think?

"Write to your government officials. Push to make changes to the laws and policies that impact how our justice system works."

Benny Vargas
NYPD Detective

To learn more about this project, visit: welcometoCUP.org/Projects/CityStudies/IsJusticeForAll

To find your elected officials, visit usa.gov/elected-officials
Should minors be charged as adults?

Should inmates be held in solitary confinement?
Is Justice For All?

ICHIS Students


CUP

Teaching Artist: Meredith Degyansky
Project Lead: Jenn Anne Williams
Project Support: Nick Johnson

ICHIS

Classroom Teachers: Nick Deming and Julia Joseph

Thanks to our interviewees:
Gustavo Rivera, Kate Rubin, and Benny Vargas

Special thanks to: Clair Beltran, Jeneuse Geula, Victor Pate, Hrudaya Veena Yanamandala, Irina Vinnitskaya, and Cin Yee Selina Cheah

“Turn up the heat on the policies you want to change. Put political pressure on government officials and show them the light. Educate and tell others about what you believe in.”

Gustavo Rivera
New York State Senator

© the Center for Urban Pedagogy, 2017